DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 442 765 SP 039 291

AUTHOR Silva, Diane Yendol
TITLE Triad Journaling as a Tool for Reconceptualizing Supervision in the Professional Development School.
PUB DATE 2000-04-28
NOTE 17p.; Paper presented at the Annual Meeting of the American Educational Research Association (New Orleans, LA, April 24-28, 2000).
PUB TYPE Reports - Research (143) -- Speeches/Meeting Papers (150)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC01 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *College School Cooperation; Cooperating Teachers; Elementary Education; Elementary School Teachers; Higher Education; *Journal Writing; Preservice Teacher Education; Professional Development Schools; *Student Journals; Student Teacher Supervisors; Student Teachers; *Teacher Collaboration

ABSTRACT

This study explored the use of triad journaling as a collaborative tool for enhancing teaching and learning in a professional development school. The triad journals expand the notion of traditional journaling between university supervisor and student teacher to include the cooperating teacher in a weekly dialogue about teaching and learning. Based on field notes, informal interviews, and the document analysis of journals collected over an 18-month period of time, the study presents four findings: (1) triad journals helped facilitate mentor role reconceptualization; (2) triad journaling led to heightened communication and reflection; (3) triad journals nurtured a problem posing culture; and (4) members of the triad described a "professional energy" created by the shared professional space. (Contains 16 references.) (Author/SM)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 442 765

SCOPE OF INTEREST NOTICE

The ERIC Facility has assigned this document for processing to: SP

In our judgment, this document is also of interest to the Clearinghouses noted to the right. Indexing should reflect their special points of view. TM

TRIAD JOURNALING AS A TOOL FOR RECONCEPTUALIZING SUPERVISION IN THE PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT SCHOOL

Diane Yendol Silva
The Pennsylvania State University

Paper Presented at AERA
New Orleans, LA
April, 2000

April, 2000

D.Y. Silva

Portsmouth, New Hampshire

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

SP 039 291

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☐ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

Abstract

This study explored the use of triad journaling as a collaborative tool for enhancing teaching and learning in a professional development school. The triad journals expand the notion of traditional journaling between university supervisor and student teacher to include the cooperating teacher in weekly dialogue about teaching and learning. Based on field notes, informal interviews, and the document analysis of journals collected over an eighteen month period of time, the study presents four findings: 1) Triad journals helped facilitate mentor role reconceptualization, 2) Triad journaling led to heightened communication and reflection, 3) Triad journals nurtured a problem posing culture, and 4) Members of the triad described a "professional energy" created by the shared professional space.

I always wondered what my student teachers' wrote about in their journals. I was so curious and actually really interested. What did they think about the kids, our classroom, the materials we used? For some reason we didn't talk deeply about these things in our daily conversations. But I have questions about them myself that I would love to share with someone else but there really isn't space to do that in schools. The journals seemed sacred to the university and whenever the topic of journals came up I know everyone at the university would say, "This is just our way of keeping in touch with what the student teacher is learning and wondering about." But I wondered too... I wanted to be a part of that dialogue. I missed the opportunity to talk about and name these things that haunted me as I taught each day.... I wanted to share in the journaling. But I never mentioned it to anyone...

The teacher journaling described above, an interpretive self-observation technique (Bolin, 1988; Zeichner & Liston, 1987), is typically used by prospective teachers as a method of recording and sharing their own observations and thoughts about their teaching practice. Holland (1998) suggests that this type of journaling forms a stable text that represents a prospective teacher's thinking about his or her own work. Within this text, contextualized descriptions of actual teaching experiences as well as the writer's underlying beliefs and values surface painting a picture of the teacher's practice.

Since teacher journals often call attention to reflections on events, beliefs, emotions, concerns, questions, problems, and future plans, journals serve as effective communication tools for supervisors who are not present on a daily basis. On the other hand, Holly and Mcloyghlin (1989) believe that journaling is a powerful method for documenting and learning from one's own experience. They argue that journaling becomes a powerful tool for self-study. Journaling also offers a way of making private inner thoughts about teaching and learning public for others to see, question, and understand. Student teacher supervisors often use journal entries to understand prospective teachers' professional selves and to gain insight into their needs and wonderings. These journals serve as a communication link between the supervisor and the student teacher. Killian (1991) suggests that in addition to learning about self and communicating with a supervisor, collegial dialogue journals can also act as a collaborative learning tool. As teachers share their journals with each other, they collaboratively problem solve and provide reciprocal support that results in strong professional relationships.

Given that journaling can lead to self-study, communication, and collaborative learning, the time seems ripe to investigate ways to use journaling to reach all three goals. For example, missing from the literature are the ways that journaling can be utilized by all three members of the student teaching triad including the prospective teacher, mentor, and university faculty. As school-university partnerships continue to grow and year-long field experiences become more prevalent, opportunities exist for building strong collaborative relationships between the three members of the student teaching triad in a way that leads to self-study, enhanced communication, and co-reflection by all three members.

In professional development schools, university-based teacher educators are joining forces with school-based partners to enhance teacher education programs. This collaboration should encourage teacher educators to rethink the way they do business in field experiences and provide heightened voice to school-based colleagues, recognizing the importance of developing strong relationships between the members of the student teaching triad, traditionally referred to as cooperating teacher, student teacher, and supervisor. To do this, new terminology and instructional tools are being explored to enhance and share roles targeted to heighten the triad's professional learning. As a result, student teachers have become interns, cooperating teachers have become mentors, and supervisors have become professional development associates or PDA's (See for example, Silva & Dana, 2000). In some cases, the traditional student teacher journal has also been expanded to include the voices and thinking of all members of the triad: intern, mentor, and PDA.

Until now, triad journaling has been relatively unexplored in the research literature as a tool for enhancing the teaching and learning of prospective teachers, practicing teachers, and university teacher educators. In reviewing the literature, most of the work has been limited to descriptions of this journaling technique used in England where a movement has been underfoot for prospective teacher education to take place in the schools (Wallace, 1999). The purpose of this study is to explore the use of triad journaling as a collaborative tool for enhancing teaching and learning in a professional development school context.

Background

Over the last four years the Mountainside Elementary School in conjunction with a Research One Institution's Elementary Education program has been developing a strong school-university partnership which more recently has been actualized as a PDS targeted at reforming the teacher education program and building an inquiry-oriented culture. These reform efforts took the form of a yearlong internship where the mentors and PDA's work side-by-side to create and reconceptualize elementary teacher education.

This work parallels the typology discussed by Frankes, Valli, and Cooper (1998) who in a review of research on PDSs discuss four roles mentors assume as they participate in PDS work. These roles are teacher as decision-maker, teacher as teacher educator, teacher as researcher, and teacher as activist. This study explored the second phase most highly congruent with developing the role of "teacher as teacher educator." During this phase, the traditional student teaching handbook was discarded and mentors were given the space to create an individual intern plan that met the needs of the intern, classroom teacher, and children (Dana, 1999). Additionally, in an effort to further the mentor's participation in the work of teacher education a triad journal was initiated and became a tool for both supervisor and mentor to share in the work of teacher education. In nine of the ten cases, the comfort with sharing this space grew out of a high level of trust developed between the PDA, the mentor and the intern. In the tenth case, less trust and interest was apparent.

These weekly journals provided a method of gaining insight into the mentor's, intern's, and PDA's thinking about the PDS work. The journaling became a part of the weekly routine of 10 triads drawn from two cohorts within a single professional development school over the course of a two year period. Beginning in September, the interns reflected approximately three

times each week in their journals. These entries typically focused on ideas, questions, or actions centered on their work and impressions of the classroom. Then, the intern passed the journals on to the PDA who added comments, questions, and often her own reflections based on her recollected teaching experience or observations of the classroom. Finally, the PDA turned the journals over to the mentor who added her own comments, responses, and thoughts about the topics discussed. These open-ended journals provided a window into the classroom, intern-mentor relationship, and mentor's teaching.

Since all three of the triad members - intern, mentor, and PDA – contributed and responded to the journal, the triad members used the journal as a vehicle for sharing their own insights about the work in which they were co-engaged as well as responding to insights or questions posed by another member of the triad.

Methods

This study employed descriptive case study methodology (Merriam, 1998) in an effort to capture the content, complexity, and interactive nature of the participants' journaling. The study investigates two years of data and the ways two cohorts of full year interns used triad journaling over the course of the school year. The unit of analysis was the intern/mentor/PDA triad and identification was based on the unique case selection procedure (Goetz and LeCompte, 1984). In this case, the unique attributes included the triad members' willingness to engage in and share the journal. This study addressed the following research questions:

1. How do mentors, interns, and PDA's use triad journals?
2. What is the content of the triad journal conversation?
3. How do the participants feel about engaging in the triad journal as a communication tool?

The techniques used to enhance the quality of the analysis and ensure trustworthiness of the study include source triangulation, method triangulation, and member checks. Source triangulation required "checking out the consistency of different sources within the same method" (Patton, 1990, p.464). Method triangulation relied on "checking out the consistency of findings generated by different data-collection methods" (Patton, 1990, p. 464). The data sources used in this analysis included: fieldnotes, open-ended interviews and written documents collected in the form of triad journals. The interviews, conducted on two occasions with the mentor and the intern, yielded direct quotations from the participants capturing their experiences, opinions, feelings, and knowledge about the use of the triad journals. The tape recordings of each interview were transcribed, allowing for accurate reporting of the participants' responses and enabling the researcher to interpret specific responses in the context of the entire transcript. The typical length of the responses was in the form of many paragraphs. The documents provided the excerpts and quotations included in the results. Fieldnotes were also collected by the PDA. Finally, periodic member checks with the mentors and interns were also a part of the analysis.

After reviewing the data set multiple times utilizing Wolcott's (1994) methodological structure of description, analysis, and interpretation, four themes emerged and as these themes took shape systematic searches of the data for disconfirming and confirming evidence were

conducted (Erickson, 1986). The remaining sections of this paper present an analysis and interpretation of the triad journal as a vehicle for enhancing teaching and learning in a PDS.

Results

Findings indicate that the triad journal served four strategic roles in the professional development school work. The journaling: 1) offered evidence of mentor/supervisor role reconceptualization, 2) escalated communication between all triad members by providing the opportunity to engage in the dialogue about teaching and learning, 3) acted as a vehicle for nurturing a problem posing culture which is a critical feature of an inquiry-oriented professional development school, and 4) created a "professional energy" associated with the process of engaging in the triad journal.

Role Reconceptualization

The journal provided evidence of role reconceptualization as teachers shifted from cooperating teachers who provide a supportive context to their student teacher to mentors who in addition to providing an intern with a caring context for learning to teach (Silva & Tom, 2000) also felt the additional responsibility of teacher education (Silva, 2000). As these mentor teachers had the opportunity to gain insight into the thoughts, worries, and questions of their interns they began to see themselves as teacher educators who assumed new roles and responsibilities in their work with interns. However, the willingness to assume these new roles did not come immediately:

> When I first discussed the idea with the teachers they seemed interested but tentative. When I probed as to why, they asked me if it was ok with the intern because this might be a place where the intern really needed some privacy to write about things they didn't like in the classroom or that they were not comfortable with their mentor hearing. (Fieldnotes 12/98)

These comments indicate that mentors did not feel it was initially a part of their job to discuss issues with interns that may be more private, challenging, missing from their own practice or issues that arise due to incongruency between mentor and intern's espoused belief systems.

In all but one case, the interns were willing and enthusiastic about reconceptualizing the journal to include their mentor in the work of teacher education:

> When I first discussed the idea with the interns, nine of the ten were interested in the idea of including their mentors in the journal conversation because they wanted a deeper understanding of their thoughts and more feedback from their mentor. The only one that was tentative was the intern with the weakest relationship with her mentor. However, she asked to be included because she thought it might be a way to get more detailed feedback and insight into her mentor's thinking and make her year run more smoothly. (Fieldnotes 12/98)

Interestingly the only intern who was skeptical about the triad journal shared the following comment in her exit interview.

> You know, I tried the three way journaling and it was good and I could see the benefits for keeping the journal. But in my opinion it was really time consuming. To keep up with it was time consuming. I had written one up and handed it to my mentor and she had the notebook for two weeks. When she finally gave it back to me she said, "I just don't have time for this right now." (Exit interview, 5/99)

This intern struggled throughout the entire internship year. Evidence exists to suggest that this was significantly due to a lack of relationship between the intern and mentor. Additionally, evidence suggests that although the journaling didn't serve as a tool for mentor involvement, the presence of the journal did not complicate the relationship.

For the nine mentors who did regularly participate in the journaling, a typology of mentor participation became apparent. The mentors first began *reinforcing statements* much like they reinforce children who share ideas with them in class. For example, comments like, "Yes, that is exactly why we do it that way" , "I am glad that you are thinking so deeply about your work", "You are very insightful about the children", "I would love to have you share more poetry with us", " This was such a great reward, maybe you can do this more" were often a part of the mentor's written comments.

Next, mentors began *explaining their thinking* behind questions that were raised by the other participants and providing advice.

> Watch for signs from the students and this will let you know when it is too long…Using the words of children is very powerful…. It is their language and their understanding…Remember, structure is not all bad. At the very base- safety is important too. Susan, as you learn more and more "little management techniques" this will also give you more time. It is amazing how small interruptions to give reminders…. add up. It is not just the … I am glad you are realizing through practice how helpful time-saving etc… small practices are. .. Finally, mentors began *raising questions* for their interns and asking their own questions. Could you give her opportunities to initiate and take a leadership role? Are you getting her attention to truly engage her? What is the difference between "wait time" and "think time?" Could these constructions be their play? I wonder? How can we better help this ESL child in our classroom?

The triad journal encouraged the mentors to move beyond sharing their classroom context with their intern to making public their thinking and questions about their teaching. The teachers began to feel a responsibility for intern growth that they previously didn't have.

The triad journal also offered the supervisor space to reconceptualize her role since her own journal responses were read by both intern and mentor:

> I often would find myself probing the mentor to respond to questions that I knew she had deeper understanding about or I wondered what her espoused platform was in a particular area. For example, I didn't know the children as well as she did. So many times I would defer the question to her. Other times I would raise

> my own questions about children or curriculum for both of them to respond to. There was even a couple times when I wrote my own entries about issues that I was struggling with in order to get their individual and collective thoughts. (Researcher's journal, 2/00)

As evidenced, the triad journal in many ways provided the momentum for the university supervisor to reconceptualize her role making it a part of her role to raise questions with the intern and the mentor.

Heightened Communication

The triad journals resulted in a heightened level of communication between the triad members. For example, one very quiet intern, Angela, who did not typically initiate discussions revealing her deeper thoughts shared:

> When we first started the triad journal it was in the back of my head that Bridgett would be reading it. But then I heard that Bridgett wanted to get into my head and understand my thinking too. Sometimes I am quiet and I do not say a lot. But in my journals, I kind of open up and I let Bridgett see what I am thinking and what is going on. I like the feedback that I get then too. (Angela, interview, 1098-1102)

The triad journal became an effective communication tool for Angela to share her thinking and wonderings with her mentor Bridgett. She adds:

> I kind of wish we would have done this sooner. I think there are questions that I should ask her but I don't. But in the triad journals she can see my thinking coming out about children and situations. I think it is a good way for everyone to see what each other is thinking. I bring up questions and those bring up more thoughts for me, more things of concern. I think it is because I have a close relationship with her. (Angela, interview, 218-223)

Bridgett also shares the following thoughts about the journal as a forum for Angela to raise questions:

> You just learn so much about how they (the interns) are feeling about things. Even the fact that Angela and I are together all day, have conversations and visit, chit chat and everything else, it is still another way to get to know her, get to look at her thinking and see what she considers important. (Bridgett, interview B, 438-441)

Bridgett writes to Angela in the journal:

> Angela, I am so enjoying your journal. It's helping me to understand issues you feel are important. You share a wonderful variety of insights and from reading it I don't feel that the journal is drudgery for you. I hope you are able to continue as your teaching load increases. (Bridgett, triad journal, 1/99)

Jerelyn Wallace (1989) who has also worked with a similar three-way dialogue journal describes the journal as a "forum for observations, questions, and reflections that chronicled the year's teaching practice as well as the evolving relationship between mentor and teacher candidate. Periodically, the university folks would jump into the conversation, adding their own responses" (p. 35). They found that, like Bridgett and Angela, many mentors viewed the dialogue journal as a tool:

> The exchange may take on a life of its own, become a welcomed place to record the joys and frustrations of teaching practice, and provide a forum through which communication among teacher candidates, mentors, and university colleagues is greatly enriched. Additionally, the journal is a reflective instrument, in both the long and short term, gives incredible insight into the process of the year - the progress of students, personal growth as an educator, the evolution of relationships and connections all the way around. (Wallace, p. 35)

Because mentors and interns are so focused on their teaching and children during the day, dialogue journals provided a tool or space for co-reflection around both practical and philosophical questions to occur (Silva, 2000).

> Often we are so busy during the day; we do not have time to discuss events, questions, ideas, etc. The journal provides for me a "window" into my intern's thinking. I am surprised by her insights, discovering what was important for her to write about, and her questions. I feel that the journals are most important at the beginning of the internship when I am just learning about my intern and this helps me know her a little better. (K.B. interview, 3/00)

Other comments included:

> I think the journals are valuable because Renee mentions ideas and concerns that haven't been brought up in our discussions. We can really talk about these things after I have had a chance to give her entries some thought rather than speaking too quickly. (LD, mentor)
> I like using the journals as another form of communication - not to replace others, just in addition to. I feel they are not time consuming. I like sitting down with them in the evenings, where I have time to reflect and some distance from the hectic pace at school. I actually look forward to reading the entries and miss the journal when it hasn't been around for a while. (CC, mentor)

The mentors demonstrate their fondness for the triad journal as they began their second year of journaling with a new set of interns. One mentor bought a special pen that writes in gold. She shared the following comment in the journal:

> I bought this pen Ann because your thoughts and our conversations are like pure gold to me. I am looking forward to hearing and seeing your thinking this year.

Nurtured a Problem-Posing Culture

The journals show potential as a vehicle for nurturing a problem posing culture, which is a critical feature of an inquiry-oriented professional development school. Over the course of the eighteen months of data collection all three members have increasingly posed questions to one another throughout the journals. However, in most cases substantially more questions continue to be raised by the PDA and the intern than the mentor. However, the mentors that have defined themselves as teacher educators tend to ask more questions in the triad journals and reveal more questions than those who still see themselves as providing a context for the intern to learn. Interestingly, a number of mentors asked the university supervisor if they were suppose to be asking questions to the intern in the triad journals or responding to questions because they noticed that this was a part of the university supervisor's responses.

Finally, mentors have indicated that the journal does provide space for all members of the triad to pose questions and that she enjoys the opportunity to consider new and different questions:

> Reflection and questions come naturally to you, Susan, as one would hope with all teachers... As "problems" become greater, one tends to prioritize what needs to be "worked out" first. This is a part of the professional work of a teacher.

Another mentor offers the following thoughts regarding the influence of the supervisor's questions in the triad journal.

> Also, I really enjoy the supervisor's comments and questions. Her thoughts open a new line of questions and reflections for the both of us! I get anything different information from the triad journals than our conversations...Yes! (K.B. interview, 3/00)

For the supervisor, the triad journal has become a tool for infusing questions about practice into collaborative conversations. As the interns write about their integrated coursework, classroom challenges, and professional responsibilities, all members of the triad begin learning from each other. The intern's initial voice in the journal provides a springboard for a variety of conversations to emerge. These collaborative conversations open the lines of communication between those focused primarily on theory and those immersed in practice creating a culture where reform-minded teacher education can take place.

Interestingly, in only a few cases did the mentor add to the journal any new topics not mentioned by the intern or PDA. Instead, in most cases the mentors responded only to the topics raised by others. Efforts should be made to help mentors see the triad journal as a tool for exploring their own practice and making their questions public to their "critical friends" as well. When the mentor spontaneously begins to see the journal as a tool for all to share their thoughts about teaching and learning, a new professional culture characterized by collaborative professional reflection and problem posing behavior will emerge. To facilitate this type of openness, the university faculty began adding their own journals to the triad journal modeling the importance of all of us sharing our thinking and hopefully flattening the power structure of supervision in the PDS to a structure that is shared between all members of the triad.

Created a Professional Energy

With the exception of one triad, all triad participants described a "professional energy" associated with the process of dialoging in the triad journal. From an intern's perspective, Angela also has learned to celebrate her own growth as she reflects in her own journal:

> My relationship with my mentor is growing stronger everyday. I feel that my ideas are really valued and that my mentor has placed a lot of confidence in me. In responding to that entry Bridgett adds, "Absolutely!" (Triad Journal, 2/99)

Another mentor shares her thoughts around professional energy gained from the journals:

> I really like the triad journals. They allow me to get to know my intern in a different way than before and we are able to discuss ideas that impact my own professional thinking. It is another way of coming out of isolation. (Claudia, interview, 3/99)

Similarly, a university supervisor shares the following professional excitement associated with participating in the triad journal:

> I must admit. One of my favorite parts of my job is reading the triad journals. I feel like it is really a gift to be able to see into the thinking of both the intern and the mentor with whom I am working. Their openness with their thoughts allows me to understand their professional espoused platforms and their on-going struggles within the classroom. We get multiple perspectives on the same issues from three professionals. I have learned a lot from my school-based partners as a result of this collaborative reflection on practice.

This last excerpt demonstrates how the triad journals provide the space and time for the type of reflection that leads to shared professional growth.

> We are so busy during the day that many times (especially during the first semester when Amy left at 2:30 several times a week) we did not have the time to talk and reflect. I feel that I NEED the journals to stay "in touch" with my intern. Several times this year, we would have long professional talks on the phone about different ideas that came from the journals. These are important to me. (K.B. interview, 3/00)

An intern reflects:

> Anyway, I do like the triad in the second half of the internship because I think it provides a great opportunity for mentors, supervisors and interns to offer suggestions, advice, express confusions, etc.... I find it very helpful. I also believe that the constant reflection is very important to my growth as an educator. I have learned a great deal about myself as I write my journals. Sometimes just by typing out my thoughts I solve a lot of my own problems. (SD, intern journal entry)

Another mentor describes how the triad journal offers her the opportunity to see her classroom through another teacher's eyes as well as time to gather her energy and thoughts for a future professional dialogue:

> It gives me time to organize my thoughts. Renee reflects on events in the classroom and that gives me a different perspective of our students, lessons, routines and my teaching. The journals help me stop and reflect. (I.D. mentor)

Discussion

Because the triad journals expand the notion of traditional journaling between university supervisor and intern to include the mentor teacher in the meaningful dialogue about teaching and learning, the mentor shares the space and responsibility of teacher education. Many supervisors steer away from sharing the journals with cooperating teachers because of the risks involved. What happens if the intern says something that offends a mentor? Only one of the interns who has participated in the triad journaling has raised this as an issue:

> I think they are very helpful in the area of communication but....I did not feel comfortable writing them in the beginning of the internship because most of my reflections were regarding my observations of Christina's teaching. I do not think this is a healthy way to start a mentor relationship. We are taught to be critical thinkers throughout our methods instruction and then when we become critical of other teaching practices it gets very sticky. I realize that we are also suppose to write "professionally" and try to careful of how we word our observations but truthfully I believe that by doing so our reflections are no longer truly authentic. Or maybe I should say they are no longer as meaningful.

This type of response demonstrates a worst case scenario of triad journaling. However, some thought must be given to our responsibility as teacher educators to help interns learn how to avoid this problem. Propective teachers need to learn how to construct and discuss problems they see in their own practice as well as the broader problems of schools. Prospective teachers need to know how to raise questions in ways that they are heard rather than silenced.

Given the potential that the triad journal has for enhancing communication, providing professional energy, reconceptualizing roles, and nurturing a problem posing culture, efforts should be made to create strong relationships that can "weather," sustain, and profit from interaction around uncomfortable and critical questions. When critical comments are raised we must find ways to help all members of the triad to understand the questions.

Mentors need support as they learn about how to nurture and provide space for intern development. Mentors do this with children and need to seek to understand their intern in this same way. For example, if a child says something that is critical of the teacher or an activity, the teacher doesn't give up on the child. Instead, a skilled teacher seeks to understand and help. In some cases, the teacher may need to rethink her approach to helping the child. In the same way, mentors need to seek to understand their interns. What makes my intern think this or ask this? How can I help her understand my thinking? Maybe there are parts of my own practice that I should revisit. In some cases, the mentor may even learn about her own practice through the eyes of the intern and make adjustments to things that initially felt uncomfortable.

Yes, including mentors in the dialogue is a risk to all members of the triad. But if the goal is reform-minded teacher education, the risk is worthy of exploring. The mentor teacher has a substantial impact on the intern's thinking. Thus, reform–minded teacher education will necessitate strong and open relationships based on shared responsibility for learning. For those committed to that goal, the triad journal offers a powerful tool for prospective and practicing teacher development as well as university teacher education faculty development.

Since the mentor teacher often has the greatest impact on the growth and development of the intern, developing open communication and strong relationships are a key component to intern growth that moves beyond basic competency (Lemma, 1993). When the relationships between all of the individuals in the triad are developed to the fullest, the greatest potential for this type of intern learning is likely. For example, when an intern is able to pose questions and share her own thinking with both her mentor and her supervisor within a trusting and supportive context, all three participants engage in meaningful and growth oriented co-reflection.

Still missing from this conversation is what Sparks-Langer and Colton (1991) describe as the critical element of reflection. This critical element refers to the substance that drives the prospective teachers' thinking including their experiences, goals, values, and understandings of social implications. Reform-minded mentoring is only as strong as the critical elements upon which it rests. Thus, as mentors reconceptualize their work, serious attention should be given to developing these critical elements as a part of the conversations surrounding their collaborative work. The challenge facing supervisors is to find ways to help mentors see the value in raising these "critical elements" as they work with interns addressing the following concern discussed by Gore and Zeichner (1991):

> We do not think that it makes much sense to promote or assess reflective practice in general without establishing clear priorities for the reflection that emerge out of a reasoned educational and social philosophy. We do not accept the implication that exists throughout much of the literature, that teachers' actions are necessarily better just because they are more deliberate and intentional. (p. 121)

As interns and mentors engage in conversations around their reasoned educational and social philosophy, reform-minded teacher education can occur. The triad journal offers a space to begin these conversations.

Further questions raised by this case include: How do members of the triad influence each other's thinking as they dialogue? How do we help prospective and practicing teachers understand and appreciate the critical stance necessary for reform-minded teacher education? What happens when the relationship isn't strong enough to sustain the intensity of critical discussion? What are the understandings that the supervisor receives as she engages in triad journaling? Although many questions remain, triad journaling shows promise as a vehicle for creating a culture where reform-minded teacher education can take place.

In conclusion, one intern shares her thinking about the triad journaling:

I have really liked the triad journals and think that they have been a wonderful opportunity for mentor, advisor, and intern to discuss educational topics and learn a lot from each other. Kim and I talk everyday but we really never have time to go in depth about a topic. After Kim has read my journals, she always takes the time to talk about them with me and answer any questions or respond to my thoughts. The journals give her a chance to see into my thinking and that has been really beneficial so she can tell more where I am at as an educator and as an individual. At first I felt overwhelmed by the journals, but I now really like being able to write one in-depth one on a certain topic or two-three "less depth ones". This gives me the opportunity to really write a lot about one topic that I am wondering about or have questions about. Also, if I don't feel that I have a topic that I really want to discuss in depth, I can focus on some other topics. I think that Kim really enjoys the three-way communication with the triad journals. We both are learning each other's philosophies of teaching and sharing different ideas with each other. If I wasn't involved with the triad journals, I think I would feel a missing piece. They have been a great communication tool in our fast-paced lives these days, and communication is key in learning and growing. It is hard to explain the wonderful opportunity it has been to learn and grow as an educator and individual with the support and guidance from both my mentor teacher and supervisor!

References

Bolin, F. (1988). Helping student teachers think about teaching. *Journal of Teacher Education*, 39, 48-54.

Dana, N. F. (1999). *The professional development school story: Assessing the impact of year one (1998-1999) of the State College Area School District- Pennsylvania State University Elementary Professional Development Schools*. Evaluation report submitted to the State College Area School District Board of Directors.

Frankes, L., Valli, L., & Cooper, D.H. (1998). Continuous learning for all adults in the professional development school: A review of the research. In D.J. McIntyre and D.M. Byrd (Eds.), *Strategies for career-long teacher education: Teacher Education Yearbook VI*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Corwin Press.

Goetz, J., and LeCompte, M. (1984). *Ethnography and qualitative design in educational research*. San Diego: Academic Press.

Gore, J.M. & Zeichner, K.M. (1991). Action research and reflective teaching in preservice teacher education: A case study from the United States. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 7, 119-136.

Holly, M.L., & Mcloughlin, C.S. (1989). Professional development and journal writing. In M.L. Holly & C.S. Mcloughlin (Eds.), *Perspectives on teacher professional development* (pp. 259-284). New York: Falmer.

Killian, J.E. (1991). Colleague journals as a staff development tool. *Journal of Staff Development, 12* (2), 44-46.

Lemma, P. (1993). The cooperating teacher as supervisor: A case study. *Journal of Curriculum and Supervision, 8*(4), 329-342.

Merriam, S. (1998). *Case study research in education: A qualitative approach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Patton, M.Q. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.

Silva, D.Y. & Dana, N.F. (2000). *Supervision in a professional development school*. Paper presented at the American Educational Research Association, New Orleans, LO.

Silva, D.Y. & Tom, A. (in press). *The moral basis of mentoring*. Teacher Education Quarterly.

Sparks-Langer and Colton, A.B. (1991). Synthesis of research on teachers' reflective thinking. *Educational Leadership*, (3), 37-44.

Wallace, J. (1999). The dialogue journal. In P. Graham, S. Hudson-Ross, C. Adkins, P. McWhorter, & J.M. Stewart (Eds.), *Teacher mentor: A Dialogue for collaborative learning*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Wolcott, H. (1994). *Transforming qualitative data: Description, analysis, and interpretation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Zeichner, K.M. & Liston, D.P. (1987). Teaching student teachers to reflect. *Harvard Educational Review, 57* (1), 23-48.